TOWARD A TRAUMA-INFORMED PHILADELPHIA:
Challenges and Opportunities from the City of Brotherly Love and Sisterly Affection
May 2016
LEARNING OBJECTIVES

To understand how trauma can affect the many different systems that make up a city infrastructure

To review the lessons learned from city leaders and service providers on integrating trauma into their existing systems

To define the adverse childhood experiences survey and how it affects health outcomes

To outline necessary policy change in order to work towards a trauma-informed city

Planning

Strategy

Develop

Ideas
How did the “Toward a Trauma Informed Philadelphia” Project come about?
Thanks to Jane Ellen Stevens

Long-time health, science and technology journalist and the moving spirit behind ACEsTooHigh.com and ACEsConnection.com
Why interviews?
Things change according to the stance we adopt towards them, the type of attention we pay to them, the disposition we hold in relation to them (p.4).

Iain McGilchrist, Iain (2009). *The Master and His Emissary: The Divided Brain and the Making of the Western World*
There’s still a lot to do but.....

FOCUS: HALF-EMPTY OR HALF-FULL?
Systems change individuals but individuals begin change in systems

Interviews so that these pioneering individuals could speak for themselves
ONE OF THE LESSONS OF TRAUMA-INFORMED CARE

Major paradigm shift for human services

Major social shifts are multigenerational

Pioneering efforts – unlikely to see long-term benefits
How did you choose who to interview?
The individuals interviewed are PART of my own network

But if we had the time, funding and opportunity, every one of them would have their own network of others

And we ran out of time and funding to complete even *my* list

So anyone we didn’t get to yet….. Stay tuned!
What questions did you ask?
How did you as a service provider come to recognize trauma as an issue?

- What did you do as a result?
- What changes have you helped facilitate in your system? How was it received? Did you encounter resistance or support?

Lessons learned?

- Have you seen real change as a result of your efforts?
- What advice would you offer to service providers in other cities/communities?

In your opinion, what are necessary next steps that should inform public policy in Philadelphia?

Look to the future (10-15 years), and tell us what you think Philadelphia as a trauma informed city would look like?
So, what do you mean by “trauma-informed and why is that so important?
Services that are grounded in and directed by a thorough understanding of the neurological, biological, psychological, social and existential effects of trauma, adversity and violence on individuals, families, organizations, communities, and societies.

(modified from NASMHPD, 2004)
PROBLEM WITH LANGUAGE
WHAT WE REALLY MEAN BY “TRAUMA”: DAMAGING KINDS OF STRESS

NORMAL STRESS
Positive Stress
Tolerable Stress

DESTRUCTIVE STRESS
Relentless Stress
Toxic Stress
Traumatic Stress
The Relationship of Adverse Childhood Experiences to Adult Health Status

• A collaborative effort of Kaiser Permanente and The Centers for Disease Control

Vincent J. Felitti, M.D.
Robert F. Anda, M.D.
Urban youth - by the age of 23 years, the lifetime occurrence of exposure to any trauma was 82.5%, with males (87.2%) more likely to be exposed than females (78.4%). (Breslau, et al. 2004)
WHAT THE EPIDEMIOLOGY OF CHILDHOOD ADVERSITY AND LIFETIME TRAUMA EXPOSURE SHOWS US

An interconnected, complex, adaptive, living world

FILLED WITH PEOPLE WHO HAVE HAD ADVERSE INDIVIDUAL, GROUP AND INTERGENERATIONAL TRAUMA AND ADVERSITY
Areas of the body affected by stress

- Brain and nerves
- Muscles and joints
- Heart
- Stomach
- Pancreas
- Intestines
- Reproductive system

- Psychobiology of stress
- Impact of trauma
- Developmental neuroscience
- Social neuroscience
- Spiritual neuroscience
CHANGING MENTAL MODELS: ATTITUDES ABOUT HUMAN DYSFUNCTION

SICK?

BAD?

SICK & BAD?
INJURED!

MAJOR PUBLIC HEALTH ISSUE

- Physical illness
- Emotional illness
- Learning problems
- Crime
- Homelessness
- Addiction
- Impaired Parenting
- Child abuse
- Poor job performance

CHANGING MENTAL MODELS
Changing the way we THINK can change EVERYTHING
It’s not “What’s wrong with you?”

It’s “What happened to you?”

Foderaro, 1991; Bloom, 1994
Well, we are talking about Philadelphia becoming a trauma-informed city, so tell us a bit about the city.
1682 Philadelphia: from Greek *philos* (love or friendship) and *adelphos* (brother)
PHILADELPHIA

Founded 1682, by William Penn, Quaker – religious freedom

Natural home for American Revolutionaries - Declaration of Independence, First and Second Congressional Congress

U.S. Capital 1790-1800

During the 19th and early 20th centuries, Philadelphia became a major industrial center and railroad hub that grew from an influx of European immigrants.
1688 First public protest against slavery
1731 First library
1743 First science institution
1748 First dancing organization
1748 First hospital
1765 First medical school
1777 First capital city
1780 First abolition law
1784 First successful daily newspaper
1790 First stock exchange
1792 First U.S. Mint
1805 First art institution
1809 First theater
1874 First zoo
1877 First department store
Became a prime destination for African Americans during the Great Migration (1910-1970)

Surpassed two million occupants by 1950.

Population erosion throughout second half of 20th century with decline of industry, unions, and suburbanization
Philadelphia's Fairmount Park is the largest landscaped urban park in the world.

Over 9200 acres of trails, woodland, wetlands
The city has more outdoor sculptures and murals than any other American city.
Ok, I get the pride, now tell us a bit about the despair – Why is the issue of trauma so relevant for the city?
POPULATION DENSITY
CONTIGUOUS UNITED STATES
for the geographically challenged among us
PHILADELPHIA METROPOLITAN REGION:
THE DELAWARE VALLEY
POPULATION DENSITY
PHILADELPHIA METROPOLITAN AREA
> 6 MILLION

Philadelphia, PA
Reading, PA
Camden, NJ
Wilmington, DE
Second largest city on the East Coast and the fifth most populous city in the United States

Delaware Valley: Philadelphia, Camden, Wilmington and suburbs – > 6 million – 4th largest media market
POPULATION DENSITY
PHILADELPHIA CITY & COUNTY
> 1.5 MILLION
## Demographics Philadelphia 2016

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>% of Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Population</td>
<td>1,526,006</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black or African American</td>
<td>661,839</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>626,221</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic or Latino</td>
<td>187,611</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>96,405</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some Other Race</td>
<td>90,731</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two or More Races</td>
<td>43,070</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Indian</td>
<td>6,996</td>
<td>Below 1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three or more races</td>
<td>4,353</td>
<td>Below 1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native Hawaiian Pacific Islander</td>
<td>744</td>
<td>Below 1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native Hawaiian</td>
<td>203</td>
<td>Below 1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Deep poverty means people with incomes below half of the poverty line.

Philadelphia’s deep-poverty rate is 12.9 percent, or around 200,000 people.

20% of families and 24% of the population were below the poverty line.

One in three Philadelphia children live below the poverty line.
MEDIAN HOUSEHOLD INCOME
PHILADELPHIA CITY & COUNTY
These numbers come from the Census and represent data gathered between 2007 and 2011, reported in 2011 dollars. They show that the wealthiest zip codes are in Center City and Chestnut Hill. These figures represent median household income; the median is the midpoint when all household incomes are listed in order of size. Average numbers are different and generally higher, in some cases by quite a bit. For instance, while the median income in Society Hill is $93,222, the average is $145,260.
% OF POPULATION BELOW FEDERAL POVERTY RATE

The highest concentration of poverty is found in parts of North Philadelphia. But poverty in Philadelphia is widespread. In 24 of the city's 46 residential zip codes, more than one of every five individuals are living below the poverty line. In only four zip codes is the poverty rate below 10 percent.
Philadelphia is an increasingly diverse city. The extent of that diversity varies widely from neighborhood to neighborhood. In half of the city’s 46 residential zip codes, the largest group, either blacks or whites, accounts for more than 75 percent of the population. In only eight zip codes is there no majority group. And only one zip code has at least 10 percent representation from blacks, whites, Hispanics and Asians. That is 19149, Mayfair and Oxford Circle in the Lower Northeast.
There is broad recognition that the current poverty line ($22,113 for a family of two adults and two children in 2010) falls far below the amount of income needed to “make ends meet” at a basic level.

As of 2015, the Pennsylvania minimum wage is $7.25 without tips.

As of 2015, the Pennsylvania minimum wage with tips is $2.83 as long as tips are at least $30 per month.
OVERLOOKED AND UNDERCOUNTED
HOW THE GREAT RECESSION IMPACTED
HOUSEHOLD SELF-SUFFICIENCY IN PENNSYLVANIA

Diana M. Pearce, Ph.D. Director, Center For Women’s Welfare, School Of Social Work, University Of Washington

October 2012

THE BENCHMARK MEASURE:
THE SELF-SUFFICIENCY STANDARD FOR PENNSYLVANIA 2012-2013
The Self-Sufficiency Standard defines the amount of income necessary:

- without public subsidies (e.g., public housing, food stamps, Medicaid or child care)
- and without private/informal assistance (e.g., free babysitting by a relative or friend, food provided by churches or local food banks, or shared housing).
FIGURE 4. The Self-Sufficiency Wage for Philadelphia and Pittsburgh Compared to Other U.S. Cities*  
One Adult with One Preschooler and One Schoolage Child, 2010

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Wage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NEW YORK CITY, NY</td>
<td>$31.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOSTON, MA</td>
<td>$29.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHICAGO, IL</td>
<td>$26.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PHILADELPHIA, PA</td>
<td>$25.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WASHINGTON, DC</td>
<td>$24.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOS ANGELES, CA</td>
<td>$24.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MILWAUKEE, WI</td>
<td>$22.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PITTSBURGH, PA</td>
<td>$22.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEWARK, NJ</td>
<td>$22.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAMDEN, NJ</td>
<td>$21.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WILMINGTON, DE</td>
<td>$20.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DENVER, CO</td>
<td>$19.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATLANTA, GA</td>
<td>$18.89</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**HOURLY SELF-SUFFICIENCY WAGE**

*City data is usually the Self-Sufficiency Standard for the county each city is located in. New York City (Queens) • Queens County; Boston • Suffolk County; Chicago • North side of Chicago; Philadelphia • Philadelphia County; Los Angeles • Los Angeles County; Milwaukee • Milwaukee County; Pittsburgh is calculated separately from the rest of Allegheny County; Newark • Essex County; Camden • Camden County; Wilmington • New Castle County; Denver • Denver County; Atlanta • Fulton County. Wages for cities other than Philadelphia, Pittsburgh, and New York City are updated using the Consumer Price Index.

**Wage calculated assuming family uses public transportation.
## APPENDIX B - TABLE 8 CONTINUED

The Annual 2012 Self-Sufficiency Standard by County and Select Family Types: Pennsylvania

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>COUNTY</th>
<th>(1) Adult</th>
<th>(2) Adult + Infant</th>
<th>(3) Adult + Preschooler</th>
<th>(4) Adult + Infant + Preschooler</th>
<th>(5) Adult + School-age + Teenager</th>
<th>(6) Adult + Infant + Preschooler + School-age</th>
<th>(7) 2 Adults + Infant + Preschooler</th>
<th>(8) 2 Adults + Preschooler + School-age</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lebanon</td>
<td>$18,797</td>
<td>$32,711</td>
<td>$36,012</td>
<td>$46,127</td>
<td>$32,380</td>
<td>$59,910</td>
<td>$53,730</td>
<td>$52,754</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lehigh</td>
<td>$23,430</td>
<td>$38,606</td>
<td>$41,115</td>
<td>$51,290</td>
<td>$40,091</td>
<td>$66,573</td>
<td>$58,686</td>
<td>$58,229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Luzerne</td>
<td>$18,317</td>
<td>$31,500</td>
<td>$31,763</td>
<td>$43,208</td>
<td>$28,880</td>
<td>$54,474</td>
<td>$50,636</td>
<td>$48,241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lycoming</td>
<td>$19,699</td>
<td>$33,407</td>
<td>$33,792</td>
<td>$44,471</td>
<td>$29,383</td>
<td>$55,150</td>
<td>$51,761</td>
<td>$47,986</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McKean</td>
<td>$17,897</td>
<td>$28,089</td>
<td>$29,117</td>
<td>$37,904</td>
<td>$27,182</td>
<td>$50,385</td>
<td>$46,512</td>
<td>$45,348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mercer</td>
<td>$18,322</td>
<td>$32,434</td>
<td>$35,139</td>
<td>$46,289</td>
<td>$31,415</td>
<td>$58,680</td>
<td>$53,648</td>
<td>$52,284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mifflin</td>
<td>$16,708</td>
<td>$27,136</td>
<td>$28,700</td>
<td>$37,903</td>
<td>$27,334</td>
<td>$51,280</td>
<td>$46,241</td>
<td>$46,167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monroe</td>
<td>$20,956</td>
<td>$37,870</td>
<td>$37,424</td>
<td>$49,002</td>
<td>$36,514</td>
<td>$62,931</td>
<td>$56,515</td>
<td>$54,307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montgomery</td>
<td>$28,594</td>
<td>$49,804</td>
<td>$52,278</td>
<td>$67,390</td>
<td>$50,879</td>
<td>$87,935</td>
<td>$76,187</td>
<td>$74,057</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montour</td>
<td>$17,358</td>
<td>$28,779</td>
<td>$33,187</td>
<td>$43,799</td>
<td>$27,188</td>
<td>$54,369</td>
<td>$50,786</td>
<td>$49,180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northampton</td>
<td>$23,595</td>
<td>$40,797</td>
<td>$40,835</td>
<td>$53,037</td>
<td>$40,403</td>
<td>$68,407</td>
<td>$60,549</td>
<td>$58,176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northumberland</td>
<td>$17,433</td>
<td>$26,556</td>
<td>$28,643</td>
<td>$36,957</td>
<td>$26,933</td>
<td>$49,738</td>
<td>$45,600</td>
<td>$45,741</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perry</td>
<td>$17,534</td>
<td>$29,106</td>
<td>$32,709</td>
<td>$42,544</td>
<td>$29,399</td>
<td>$55,094</td>
<td>$49,673</td>
<td>$49,849</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philadelphia</td>
<td>$22,146</td>
<td>$42,518</td>
<td>$42,691</td>
<td>$57,746</td>
<td>$43,632</td>
<td>$75,643</td>
<td>$63,472</td>
<td>$61,199</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Nearly 62% of Philadelphia households take in less than $50,000/year.

Two adults with one school-age child and one preschooler:
- Annual Self-Sufficiency Income = $59,000 combined
- Hourly Self-Sufficiency Income = $14.09 per hour for each adult
TRYING TO PARENT...

**TABLE 4. Wages of Pennsylvania’s Ten Largest Occupations: 2010**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OCCUPATION TITLE</th>
<th>NUMBER OF EMPLOYEES</th>
<th>Annual Median Income*</th>
<th>Percent of Standard**</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Retail Salespersons</td>
<td>204,630</td>
<td>$21,050</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cashiers</td>
<td>156,520</td>
<td>$17,223</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office Clerks General</td>
<td>155,080</td>
<td>$26,128</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Registered Nurses</td>
<td>129,060</td>
<td>$50,454</td>
<td>133%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combined Food Preparation and Serving Workers Including Fast Food</td>
<td>125,520</td>
<td>$16,860</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laborers and Freight Stock and Material Movers Hand</td>
<td>109,810</td>
<td>$24,715</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer Service Representatives</td>
<td>102,700</td>
<td>$30,227</td>
<td>66%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Janitors and Cleaners Except Maids and Housekeeping Cleaners</td>
<td>98,760</td>
<td>$22,877</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waiters and Waitresses</td>
<td>97,990</td>
<td>$16,416</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secretaries Except Legal Medical and Executive</td>
<td>83,670</td>
<td>$28,450</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

THE ANNUAL SELF-SUFFICIENCY STANDARD FOR ONE ADULT, ONE PRESCHOOLER, AND ONE SCHOOLAGED CHILD IN CUMBERLAND COUNTY $45,604

** Percent of the Standard for one adult, one preschooler, and one schoolaged child in Cumberland County.
## Unemployment

### Unemployment Rate

**City of Philadelphia**
- 2002: 7.3%
- 2003: 7.5%
- 2004: 7.3%
- 2005: 6.7%
- 2006: 6.2%
- 2007: 6.0%
- 2008: 7.1%
- 2009: 9.6%
- 2010: 10.3%
- 2011: 10.8%
- 2012: 10.7%

**U.S.**
- 2002: 5.8%
- 2003: 6.0%
- 2004: 5.5%
- 2005: 5.1%
- 2006: 4.6%
- 2007: 4.6%
- 2008: 5.8%
- 2009: 9.3%
- 2010: 9.6%
- 2011: 9.0%
- 2012: 8.1%

**Pennsylvania**
- 2002: 5.6%
- 2003: 5.7%
- 2004: 5.4%
- 2005: 5.0%
- 2006: 4.5%
- 2007: 4.4%
- 2008: 5.3%
- 2009: 7.9%
- 2010: 8.4%
- 2011: 7.9%
- 2012: 7.8%

**Phila. Metro Area**
- 2002: 5.4%
- 2003: 5.4%
- 2004: 5.1%
- 2005: 4.7%
- 2006: 4.5%
- 2007: 4.3%
- 2008: 5.4%
- 2009: 8.2%
- 2010: 8.9%
- 2011: 8.6%
- 2012: 8.5%
Among the comparison cities, Philadelphia had the second highest average unemployment rate in 2012, behind Detroit.
Poverty and its byproduct, food insecurity, are getting worse in Philadelphia and Pennsylvania, according to federal and state data.

The state has more than 1.8 million recipients of food stamps, or SNAP. More than a quarter of them, or 500,000, are in Philadelphia. That is a third of the city’s population.

Children – individuals under the age of 18 – make up 40 percent of the participants in the Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program (SNAP), according to the data.
Mariana Chilton, director of the Center for Hunger-Free Communities at Drexel University's School of Public Health, says that at the height of the Great Recession, nearly half of all families with kids in this city reported "food hardship" — or increased hunger.

She says the research is overwhelming: Poverty and hunger undermine children's cognitive, social and emotional development.
Every school in the School District of Philadelphia satisfies the federal definition of a "low-income school," meaning at least 30 percent of their students are low-income. In the least poor school, the rate is 44 percent.

In 74 of 267 Philadelphia District schools, over 90 percent of the student body qualifies for free or reduced price lunch.
High-poverty schools are more likely to have teachers with only 1-2 years experience.

Percentage of Teachers with 1-2 Years Experience in District, by School Level AND Percentage Low Income (includes all teachers)

- **K-8 Schools**: 11% (1362), 16% (489), 22% (1633)
- **High Schools**: 16% (1375), 21% (927), 22% (523)
- **Middle Schools**: 12% (531), 23% (175), 32% (435)
- **Elementary Schools**: 8% (745), 11% (548), 14% (1069)

(Actual number of teachers in white)
POVERTY AND EDUCATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE 3: COUNSELOR AND STUDENT SUPPORT REDUCTIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neighborhood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citywide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magnet</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Philadelphia students experienced significant staff losses due to budget cuts.

From the PCCY report:
Separate and Unequal: A Path Forward for Neighborhood High Schools
December 2015

www.pccy.org
POVERTY AND EDUCATION

4.3 NATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRESS TEST RESULTS 2011

COMPARING PHILADELPHIA TO NATIONAL AND LARGE CITY AVERAGES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Basic or below</th>
<th>Proficient or advanced</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>FOURTH-GRADERS, MATH</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U.S. average</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Large-city average</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philadelphia</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>FOURTH-GRADERS, READING</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U.S. average</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Large-city average</td>
<td>77%</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philadelphia</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>EIGHTH-GRADERS, MATH</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U.S. average</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Large-city average</td>
<td>74%</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philadelphia</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>EIGHTH-GRADERS, READING</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U.S. average</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Large-city average</td>
<td>77%</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philadelphia</td>
<td>84%</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results of another set of standardized tests, this one designed by the National Association of Educational Progress, show public-school students in Philadelphia scoring well below both the national average and the average for large cities on math and reading. The test, which was last given in 2011, is part of a federal program that operates independently of the U.S. Department of Education.
### Making Adequate Yearly Progress in Philadelphia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>22 of 258</td>
<td>57 of 265</td>
<td>160 of 265</td>
<td>132 of 268</td>
<td>131 of 266</td>
<td>107 of 268</td>
<td>113 of 265</td>
<td>118 of 267</td>
<td>158 of 267</td>
<td>110 of 258</td>
<td>33 of 250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>59%</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### High School Graduation in Philadelphia’s District-Run Schools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Class</th>
<th>In Four Years</th>
<th>In Five or Six Years</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Class of 2005</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class of 2006</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class of 2007</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>61%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class of 2008</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class of 2009</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>61%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class of 2010</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class of 2011</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class of 2012</td>
<td>64%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In 2012, the school district saw a big drop in the percentage of its schools that made Adequate Yearly Progress as defined by U.S. Department of Education under the No Child Left Behind Act. One reason was that the standards became much tougher. The statewide rate in 2012 was 49 percent, down from 82 percent in 2010.

Improving the graduation rate in Philadelphia’s district-run high schools has been a priority of school administrators and Mayor Michael Nutter. The four-year rate in 2012 was 64 percent, which is higher than it had been but well below the national four-year rate of 78 percent.
According to the Census, the educational attainment level in Philadelphia, though rising, is well below the national average and the levels of most of the comparison cities. Among the nation’s 25 largest cities, Philadelphia ranks 22nd. The Philadelphia region as a whole fares much better; 33 percent of the region’s adults are college graduates, ranking it in the top third of the 100 largest metropolitan areas.
Since 1988, nearly 9,000 people have been slain on the streets of Philadelphia, affecting every neighborhood in the city.

To put that deadly toll in perspective, during the length of U.S. combat operations in the Iraq war, 3,517 American troops were killed in action — and 3,113 people were killed in Philadelphia.
Crime in Philadelphia

Browse the change in crimes reported from Jan. 1, 2013 to Dec. 15, 2013 in Philadelphia. Drag slider to see where crime happens or click play to animate the map. Click on the crime type to narrow your view to specific crime types.

CRIMES FROM JAN. 1, 2013 TO DEC. 15, 2013

VIOLENT CRIMES

15,010

Homicides - 257
Rapes - 923
Robberies - 6,098
Assault - 7,132

Percent of violent crimes: 22.32%

PROPERTY CRIMES

52,265

Burglary - 9,271
Thefts - 33,930
Auto - 9,064

Percent of property crimes: 77.69%

SEARCH DIFFERENT DATES

01/01/2013 TO 12/15/2013

© 2013 INTErSTATE GENERAL MEDIA

SOURCES: PHILADELPHIA POLICE DEPARTMENT, U.S. CENSUS BUREAU, INQUIRER ANALYSIS
POVERTY & CRIME

PHILADELPHIA HOMICIDE VICTIMS: WHO THEY ARE AND HOW THEY DIED
2007 THROUGH 2011

- 88% MALE
- 82% GUNSHOT
- 81% PRIOR ARRESTS
- 80% AFRICAN AMERICAN
- 74% KILLED OUTDOORS
- 62% AGE 18–34
SIX DEAD AMID DAY OF SHOOTINGS, STABBINGS IN PHILADELPHIA

VIOLENT NIGHT IN PHILADELPHIA; 5 SHOT IN 4 SEPARATE SHOOTINGS

5 Shootings Leave 7 Wounded, 3 Dead in Violent 4-Hour Span Across Philadelphia

By Morgan Zalot
HOMICIDE IN PHILADELPHIA 1988-1992

www.philly.com

July 26, 2012

2,233 HOMICIDES FROM 1988 TO 1992

Source: Philadelphia Police Department
Produced by: Rob Kandel, Michele Tranquilli / Staff
HOMICIDE IN PHILADELPHIA 1988-1997

www.philly.com
July 26, 2012
HOMICIDE IN PHILADELPHIA 1988-2006

www.philly.com
July 26, 2012
HOMICIDE IN PHILADELPHIA 1988-2011

www.philly.com

July 26, 2012

Source: Philadelphia Police Department
Produced by: Rob Kandel, Michele Tranquilli / Staff
8 - 9,000 calls to the DV Hotline per year

911 calls about DV/year = over 100,000

More than 13,000 Protection from Abuse Orders are filed in Philadelphia every year
Women Organized Against Rape receives over 2,400 calls to the hotline

Special Victims Unit oversees investigation of child and adult sexual abuse and child physical abuse have over 5,000 cases/year
A collaborative, originally led by the Institute for Safe Families (ISF) and now by Health Federation, to develop and implement research, practice, and policies in urban pediatric settings based on the Adverse Childhood Experiences (ACE) study.
ACE Study Population is not Representative of Urban Populations
(R. Wade, M.D. 2015)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Demographics</th>
<th>ACE Study</th>
<th>Philadelphia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mean age</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Race/ethnicity</td>
<td>79% White</td>
<td>41% White</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5% African American</td>
<td>43% African American</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5% Hispanic</td>
<td>12% Hispanic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school graduates</td>
<td>94%</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College graduates</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent below FPL</td>
<td>Not measured</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conventional ACEs</td>
<td>Expanded ACEs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Abuse</td>
<td>Witnessing Violence</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotional Abuse</td>
<td>Living in Unsafe Neighborhoods</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sexual Abuse</td>
<td>Experiencing Racism</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotional Neglect</td>
<td>Living in Foster Care</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Neglect</td>
<td>Experiencing Bullying</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domestic Violence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Household Substance Abuse</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incarcerated Care Provider</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental Illness in the Home</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Many of the Traditional ACEs are More Prevalent in an Urban Setting  
(R. Wade, 2015)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Philadelphia ACE Study (N = 1,784)</th>
<th>Kaiser ACE Study (N = 17,337)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Emotional abuse</td>
<td>33.2%</td>
<td>10.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical abuse</td>
<td>35.0%</td>
<td>28.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sexual abuse</td>
<td>16.2%</td>
<td>20.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical neglect</td>
<td>19.1%</td>
<td>14.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotional neglect</td>
<td>7.7%</td>
<td>9.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Substance abusing household member</td>
<td>34.8%</td>
<td>26.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mentally ill household member</td>
<td>24.1%</td>
<td>19.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Witnessed domestic violence</td>
<td>17.9%</td>
<td>12.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Household member in prison</td>
<td>12.9%</td>
<td>4.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Overlap Between Exposure to Conventional and Expanded ACEs

(R. Wade, M.D. 2015)

- 17.2% No ACEs
- 19.6% > 1 Conventional ACE
- 49.3% > 1 Conventional ACE & > 1 Expanded ACE
- 13.9% > 1 Expanded ACE
Total ACE Score ≥ 4 by Zip Code

Health Statistics from these 5 Zip Codes
- 22% of adults unemployed
- 46% of residents live in poverty
- Life expectancy for males age 68
- 22% of children obese
- Homicide rate 30 to 40 deaths per 100,000
So, given there is so much to be addressed, what progress have we made and how did it happen?
  • Quakertown Community Hospital (1980-1991)
  • Friends Hospital (1996-1999)
  • Horsham Clinic (1999-2001)

• Children’s Crisis Treatment Center – outpatient rx child survivors (Tony Valdez)
• Women Against Abuse – shelter and legal services
• Women Organized Against Rape – first rape crisis center in U.S. Support Center for Child Advocacy – train lawyers for pro bono (Frank Cervone)
• Edna Foa developing exposure therapy as important treatment approach
• ISTSS scientific advances – “trauma theory” being articulated

• Physicians for Social Responsibility: First RADAR training – Domestic Violence – Trauma Theory as underpinning; First ever DV training to 350 medical students

• Philadelphia Bar Association and Support Center for Child Advocacy sponsor training in trauma theory

• Carol Tracy: Women’s Law Project – litigation for survivors of sexual abuse; Working Group for Chemically-dependent Women: trauma training

• Kalma Kartell-White: BHTEN Begins Cycles of Violence trainings – over twenty years trained thousands in trauma theory, TREM, VT, etc.

• Suzanne Daub at Delaware Valley Community Health began integrating co-located behavioral health into primary care
• Police officer, Altovise Love-Craighead loses brother, Emir to homicide. Family creates Every Murder is Real to provide support to community members
• RADAR trainings for medical schools, federally qualified health clinics, other providers (until 2009 will train 32,000 people)
• *Creating Sanctuary* published
• ACEs Study results published
• Pennsylvania State Task Force on Domestic Violence – trauma theory as underpinning
• Trauma Study Group – Sanctuary, Friends Hospital
• Philadelphia Inquirer exposes police scandal re: rape statistics
• Women’s Law Project do case reviews and help change police practices for victims
• Institute for Safe Families continue RADAR trainings, Men Can campaign, CHANCE – early childhood, First ever “screening for DV” for 400 Philadelphia Health Department staff, Funded by DHS to convene DV Collaborative
• Institute for Safe Families incorporates – continuing focus on trauma theory
• ISF urges Mayor Street to proclaim “Health Cares about DV” – now annual
• With ISF support PDPH adopts DV Policy for Adult Medicine
• Pediatrician from Children’s Hospital, Ken Ginsburg starts writing and speaking about resilience
• 9-11 – Trauma awareness increases nationally
• Community Legal Services training and retreats; Development of S.E.L.F. curriculum; Deb Freedman and Liz Thul at CLS urge DHS to fund instituting S.E.L.F. curriculum in various settings
• Women’s Law Project, funded by CBH, with support from Estelle Richman (local, state and then Federal Govt) develops report on “Unmet Needs of Pregnant and Parenting Chemically Dependent Women”

• Trauma theory as organizing framework – recommend system interventions:

  • “Philadelphia’s health and human service delivery system does not address the specific needs of women, does not integrate the linkage of trauma, violence, and substance abuse in service delivery, lacks cross-system training, and fails to fully comprehend the long term needs of families affected by trauma, violence and substance abuse.

• The key recommendation of the report was that Philadelphia must develop a trauma-informed system of care.

• Nancy Kassam-Adams and Children’s Hospital open Center for Pediatric Traumatic Stress,
• Behavioral Health, MR, SA, and CBH combined under one lead organization within Philadelphia City Government with aim of service integration

• Mayor John Street creates Domestic Violence Task Force, headed by Women’s Law Project Director, Carol Tracy, and Task Force trained in trauma theory and included police, DA’s, DV advocates, social service advocates

• Arthur Evans become Director of DBHIDS – supports trauma initiative and recovery framework – transformation

• First trauma course (elective) Penn SW

• Children’s services professionals representing DHS, DBH, School District, Public Health in City of Philadelphia began meeting as a Steering Committee

• ISF, PDPH, and CHOP Care Response to IPV” – 300 people attend

• DHS Funds ISF: “Parenting After Violence”
• Believing in Recovery Creating Opportunity Fostering Hope. Mental Health Association Conference, Philadelphia, PA
• Dr. Nicole Vaughn, Drexel School of PH, community-based research, working on health equity in Southwest part of Philadelphia
• Trauma Training for monitoring staff of Community Behavioral Health
• Sanctuary Institute begins as training arm for the Sanctuary Model – organizational change approach – DBHIDS, Office of Supportive Housing, Department of Human Services, etc.
• Institute for Safe Families brings Rob Anda to PHL
• DBHIDS forms first Trauma Task Force
• Bryn Mawr SW starts continuing ed trauma course
• Philadelphia Inquirer exposes Daniael Kelly case and DHS problems
• Child Welfare Review Panel formed and included Carol Tracy, well-versed in trauma theory
• Health Federation creates *Multiplying Connections Initiative* to develop a Cross System Training Institute, created the foundational *Becoming Trauma Informed* training curriculum and trained children's services professional, core competencies for trauma informed practice for young children
• *Center for Nonviolence and Social Justice*, Drexel School of Public Health and with Drexel Med, *Healing Hurt People*, in ER
• PA Department of Public Welfare funds Sanctuary Model training for 30 PA child welfare/juvenile justice residential settings

• Anne Marie Ambrose, formerly in juvenile justice services for the state, becomes Commissioner of DHS Institute

• Institute for Family Professionals starts first trauma courses - have trained over hundreds teachers, early childhood specialists, clinicians

• John Rich’s book, *Wrong Place, Wrong Time: Violence in the Lives of Young Black Men* is published

• ISF brings Linda Chamberlain to discuss Amazing Brain – 400 people attend

• *Healing Hurt People* expands to St. Christopher’s Hospital for Children and regularly begins convening other city service representatives

• DBHIDS hires manager for trauma-informed services, Ava Ashley

• Philadelphia adopts legislation providing unpaid leave for victims of domestic violence, sexual assault, and stalking

• Family Court Training
• Institute for Safe Families convenes “Spare the Rod”, first large conference (over 600 people) on corporal punishment of children with Geoffrey Canada
• DBH creates Practice Guidelines including “trauma-informed care”
• Destroying Sanctuary: The Crisis in Human Service Delivery Systems is published
• Healing Hurt People becomes one of three collaborators including CHOP and FIPC at Penn for the National Network of Hospital-based Violence-Intervention Programs
• DBHIDS funds the Sanctuary Institute to train 17 MH programs in Sanctuary Model, Prolonged Exposure and/or TFCBT
• United Way sponsors conference of 250 to hear about Bruce Perry’s neurosequential approach for evaluating traumatized children
• Scattergood funds several conferences with Dart Center for Journalism and Trauma
• ISF develops and launches Partnering with Parents funded by Barra Foundation
• Inquirer keeps pressure on schools
• Philadelphia Inquirer keeps up the pressure on bringing issues to the forefront of local attention
• Office of Supportive Housing funds Sanctuary Institute to train 20 shelters including Salvation Army, Susan Brotherton, Sandy Sheller, Michael O’Bryan
• Joe Foderaro and Eda Kauffman start group of shelter providers who meet regularly
• Sanctuary Institute trainings for DBH Executive Team, PIP Teams, DHS
• Mastery Charter Schools begin developing a trauma-informed approach to education
• Stoneleigh funds several fellows in trauma-informed work, Jody Greenblatt, Ted Corbin
• Bruce Perry training initiated through Suzanne O’Connor at United Way and Diane Wagenhals at Institute for Family Professionals
• Scattergood funds WHYY to hire behavioral health reporter Maiken Scott: Various programs at WHYY – public television - give coverage to issues surrounding trauma, violence, violence prevention
• ISF convenes ACEs Task Force
• ISF with RWJF convene National Collaborative on Adversity and Resilience (NCAR) and ISF produces the *Community Resilience Cookbook*
• Philadelphia University under Dale Michaels and Jeanne Felter start a Master’s program in Community and Trauma Counseling
• ISF transitions its work to CCTC, Health Federation, Lutheran Settlement House
• Under leadership of U.S. Attorney Zane Memeger, U.S. Executive Assistant U.S. Attorney, Robert Reed arranges for presentation to Third Circuit judges and satellite broadcast on trauma at National Advocacy Center; also significant re-entry work, police training and youth court.
• Health Federation continues with Philadelphia ACEs Project under Leslie Lieberman – many people involved, pediatric leadership – Joel Fein and Roy Wade, CHOP; Lee Pachter – St. Chris

• PHMC and Urban ACEs Study

• Stephen and Sandy Sheller 11th Street Health Clinic, trauma-informed health care, Patti Gerrity, Director

• Films made in Philadelphia:
  • *Pull of Gravity* – about re-entry
  • Part IV – *Wounded Places* – of larger *Raising of America* series
  • *Caregivers* – about all kinds of professional caregivers
• Trauma-Informed Philadelphia
• Crystal Wyatt, Dr. Nicole Vaughn and CityLights Network: Building Resilience with Community Leaders using the Sanctuary Model in Southwest Philadelphia.
• Healing Hurt People replication – Temple, Einstein, Penn
• Judge Charles Ehrlich, Court of Common Pleas, arranges for judicial training in trauma theory for criminal court
• Center for Hunger-Free Communities – S.E.L.F. and finance
• Ana Nunez, Professor of Medicine, becomes Dean for Diversity, Equity and Inclusion, Drexel School of Medicine
• SMASH Strawberry Mansion: A Sanctuary for Hope
  • U.S. Attorney’s Office
  • Department of Justice
  • Widener School of Social Work
What can people take away from this?
Small Nonprofits

- William Penn Foundation
- The Philadelphia Foundation
- Scattergood Foundation
- Stoneleigh Foundation
- United Way
- Barra Foundation
- First Hospital Foundation
- Claneil Foundations
- Fels Fund
- CHG Charitable Trust
- The Fourjay Foundation
- Valentine Foundation
- Pew Charitable Trust

Advocates

- Women’s Law Project
- Support Center for Child Advocacy
- Institute for Safe Families
- PSR
- Community Legal Services
- Health Federation
- Center for Nonviolence and Social Justice

Local Foundations

- Passion
- Knowledge
- Leadership
- Creativity
- Connections
• Small nonprofits become «key nodes» in a network
• Agile and innovative

- Women’s Law Project
- Support Center for Child Advocacy
- Institute for Safe Families
- PSR
- Health Federation
- Community Legal Services
- Center for Nonviolence and Social Justice
CHANGING SYSTEMS

- Advocates
- Nonprofits
- Conveners
- Media & Funders
- Systems
- Government
• There is growing universal recognition that trauma is a central public health problem for all of our service systems
• History – Philadelphia has big-city problems with a small town mentality
• There is a strong non-profit community of advocates
• Civic pride and loyalty – long history
• Network is emerging with increased rapidity
• We have local funders who connect to each other
WEAKNESSES

• History – Philadelphia has big-city problems with a small town mentality
• Long history of racial divide
• Every system has its own reasons for resisting trauma-informed change
• School system in crisis
• Little technological integration
• Economic crisis continues unabated for those in poverty
• Problematic statewide divisions, urban and rural
• Unstable national political situation
**OPPORTUNITIES**

- Systems exist and have infrastructure in place
- Everyone is getting sick of the violence
- There are many advocates of several generations in place
- There are local funders
- Local media has significant interest in issue
- Changes in health care
- There is sufficient knowledge available about trauma, adversity, toxic stress to provide shared value system for widespread change
• Economic situation – significant class, race, geographic, political divisions that prevent positive change
• Repetitive crisis distracting from long-term vision
• Insufficient leadership, turnover, succession planning
• Countervailing social forces in state and nation – i.e. gun control, prison-industrial complex, retributive justice system, increasing impoverishment of middle class tax base
| All the problems we have as a society are preventable – what happens in early childhood matters for a lifetime – in every way |
| Partnerships that are conscious and deliberate – smart funders who are knowledgeable themselves |
| Look what happened in thirty years – there is hope – we now have many answers, we now have better questions |
| Need a shared value system, need to focus on staff and management, need to believe that change is possible |
| Taking the long view – what will prevail in spite of political winds of change. |
| Accelerate the pace? |
INTEGRATED, INNOVATIVE PUBLIC HEALTH APPROACH TO ALL HUMAN SERVICES
PUBLIC HEALTH APPROACH

Everybody
At risk
Already injured
ADVERSITY AND TRAUMA AS CENTRAL CONCERNS FOR PUBLIC HEALTH

TERTIARY PREVENTION: TREATMENT

SECONDARY PREVENTION: AT-RISK

PRIMARY PREVENTION: UNIVERSAL PRECAUTIONS

MENTAL HEALTH
HEALTH CARE
CHILD WELFARE
EARLY CHILD
EDUCATION
WELFARE
HOUSING
JUSTICE
CORRECTIONS
TRAUMA-INFORMED COMMUNITY
• Universal knowledge about trauma, adversity and its effects

SECONDARY: Trauma-responsive

• Policies and practices in place to minimize damage and maximize opportunities for healthy growth and development in populations at risk and in the staff who serve them.

TERTIARY: Trauma-specific

• Therapeutic interventions that specifically explore the trauma in the initial phases of therapy and then utilize those discoveries as a foundation as the therapy moves into current issues
If we can have a Manhattan Project to create a nuclear bomb, couldn’t we have a Philadelphia Project to save the lives of children?
Co-create a vision of a better city, state, country and go for it
Thank you to:

- Jennifer Kolker
- Eleanor Lippman
- Larissa Mogano
- Crystal Wyatt
- Rosie Mae Henson
- Lucy Perpich
And a special thank-you to our interviewees:

- Susan Brotherton
- Frank Cervone
- Mariana Chilton
- Theodore Corbin
- Charles Ehrlich
- Arthur Evans
- Joel Fein
- Jean Felter
- Joseph Foderaro
- Patti Gerrity
- Ken Ginsburg
- Kalma Kartell-White
- Cara King
- Leslie Lieberman
- Altovise Love-Craighead
- Ana Nunez
- Daniel O’Brien
- Michael O’Bryan
- Suzanne O’Connor
- Joseph Pyle
- Robert Reed
- John Rich
- Ruth Ann Ryan
- Sandy Sheller
- Carol Tracy
- Nicole Vaughn
- Crystal Wyatt
- Anthony Valdez
Questions